

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

950 S. COAST DRIVE, SUITE 220 COSTA MESA, CALIFORNIA 92626 TELEPHONE (714) 850-9390 FACSIMILE (714) 850-9392

July 14, 2009

### <u>SIXTY DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE ENTITIES LISTED ON EXHIBIT A HERETO PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ</u>

This Sixty Day Notice of Intent to Sue is sent by Dr. Richard Sowinski to the persons and entities listed on Exhibit A hereto (hereinafter "the Violators") to inform them that they have violated and continue to violate California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq., commonly known as Proposition 65) by manufacturing air fresheners in California without providing a clear and reasonable warning that those products when used by consumers expose those consumers and all persons in the area of such use to Chemicals which are on the Governor's list, as expressed at 22 C.C.R. 12000, and are known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity (hereinafter "the Designated Chemicals").

#### (1) General Information.

For general information regarding Proposition 65, please see the attached "The California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary," which was prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment of the California Environmental Protection Agency. (A copy is not provided to the public enforcement agencies which receive copies of this notice.) 22 California Code of Regulations § 12903(b)(1).

#### (2) Description of Violations.

Alleged Violators: Entities listed on Exhibit A hereto.

**Consumer Product:** Products designated as Air Fresheners or Neutralizers and identified by name and manufacturer on Exhibit A hereto.

#### The Designated Chemicals Involved in Alleged Violations:

#### 1. <u>Chemicals Causing Cancer</u>

Acetaldehyde 90 (inhalation) (μg/day): 22CCR Section 12705(c) Formaldehyde (gas) 40 (μg/day): 22CCR Section 12705(c) Pentachlorophenol 40 (μg/day): 22CCR Section 12705(c)

#### 2. <u>Chemicals Causing Reproductive Toxicity</u>

Ethylene glycol monoethyl ether (EGEE) 750 (oral) (μg/day 960 (inhalation) (μg/day) Ethylene glycol monoethyl ether acetate (EGEEA) 1100 (oral) (μg/day 1400 (inhalation) (μg/day)

Ethylene glycol monomethyl ether 63 (oral) (μg/day) Ethylene glycol monomethyl ether acetate 98 (oral) (μg/day) Ethylene oxide 20.0 (μg/day)

**Time Period of Violations:** From at least July 1, 2005 to the present day.

Route of Exposure: Inhalation and ingestion.

#### **Nature of Alleged Violations:**

The Violators manufacture air fresheners for sale in California. When such air fresheners are used by consumers they expose those persons and all persons in the area of such use to the Designated Chemicals. As noted above, these Designated Chemicals are on the Governor's list, as expressed at 22 C.C.R. 12000, and are known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity. The Violators do not provide California consumers with clear and reasonable warnings regarding exposure to the Designated Chemicals as a consequence of the reasonably foreseeable use of air fresheners. Without first receiving clear and reasonable warnings (as required by Proposition 65), California consumers purchase air fresheners, use them and can thereby unwittingly inhale and ingest the Designated Chemicals, as can any other person in the area where the air fresheners are or have been used.

Noticing Individual: This Notice is provided by Dr. Richard F. Sowinski, who is a California citizen and who has an interest in protecting the public from health hazards posed by toxic chemicals. Dr. Sowinski's address and telephone number are: 1457 Ramsay Circle, Walnut Creek, California 94597, (925) 938-2693. However, Dr. Sowinski requests that all inquiries about this Notice be directed to him at the following address and telephone number:

Dr. Richard F. Sowinski c/o Anthony G. Graham, Esq. Graham & Martin LLP 950 South Coast Drive, Ste. 220 Costa Mesa, CA 92626 Telephone: (714) 850-9390 Facsimile: (714) 850-9392

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d), the Noticing Individual intends to bring suit in the public interest against the Alleged Violator sixty (60) days hereafter to correct the violations occasioned by the failure to warn of exposures to listed chemicals.

Very truly yours,

Anthony G. Graham

**Enclosures** 

#### **EXHIBIT A**

President
 Air Delights, Inc.
 9974 SW Arctic Dr.
 Beaverton, OR. 97005

#### Brand Name:

Microburst 3000 Automatic Air Fresheners & Neutralizers
Linen Fresh, Orchard Fields (Vita Splash), Mountain Peaks, Country Delight, Ocean
Breeze, Vanilla Royale, Cinnamon Spice, Orchard Valley, Blue Splash, Mango,
Delicious Apple, Mandarin Orange, Luscious Peach, Aroma-Impact VIVA, Aroma-Impact RISQUE, Kleer II Air Cleaner, Powder, Lemon, Wave, Meadow

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

President
 Chase Products Co.
 19th and Gardner Road
 Broadview, IL 60155

#### **Brand Names:**

CHAMPION MULBERRY METERED AIR FRESHENER, Champion Sprayon
Bayberry Metered Air Freshener, Champion Sprayon Vanilla Breeze Air Freshener,
Champion Sprayon Spring Linen Air Freshener, Champion Sprayon Ocean Mist Metered
Air Freshener, Champion Sprayon Pina Colada Metered Air Freshener, Champion
Sprayon Jubilee/Cherry Metered Air Freshener, Champion Sprayon Orange Sun Metered
Air Freshener, Champion Sprayon Georgia Peach Metered Air Freshener, Champion
Sprayon Powder Fresh Metered Air Freshener, Champion Sprayon Odor Neutralizer
Metered Air Freshener

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

3. President
Claire Manufacturing Company
1005 Westgate
Addison, IL 60101

Claire air fresheners are sold in California by:

Ofer Sababosh, President The Betty Mills Company 2121 S. El Camino Real Suite D-100

#### San Mateo, CA 94403

#### **Brand Name:**

CLA108, CLA112, CLA118, CLA109, CLA104, CLA110, CLA120, CLA116, CLA106, CLA114, CLA122, CLA105, CLA107, C-008 Floral Disinfectant Spray for Hospital Use, C-009 Floral Disinfectant Spray for Hospital Use, C-010 Lemon Disinfectant Spray for Hospital Use, C-011 Lemon Disinfectant Spray for Hospital, C-014 Disinfectant Spray for Health Care Use, C-015 Disinfectant Spray for Health Care Use, C-018 Disinfectant Spray for Health Care Use (Country), C-865 Bathroom Cleaner, C-866 Bathroom Cleaner, C-873 Germicidal Cleaner, C-876 Germicidal Cleaner (Country Fresh Scent), C-136 Lemon Aire, C-141 Mint Aire, C-158 Rain Forest, C-159 Vanilla, C-160 Potpourri, C-161 Apple, C-162 Cinnamon, C-164 Bright Citrus Air Freshener. C-173 Autumn Leaves Air Freshener, C-180 Apple Orchard, C-182 Canadian Pine, C-184 Baby Powder, C-186 Tropic Breeze, C-188 Cinnamon Spice 20, C-190 Gleme Malodor Neutralizer

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

 Christopher B. (Chris) Combe, President Combe Incorporated 1101 Westchester Avenue White Plains, N.Y. 10654

**Brand Name:** 

Odor-Eaters, Odor-Eaters Antifungal Spray, Odor-Eaters Foot & Sneaker Spray, Liter Odor Neutralizer

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

5. President
CONTINENTAL MFG CO
123 Byasee
Hazelwood, MO 63042

Brand Name:

KLEEN MIST AIR FRESHENER

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

6. Bradley A. Casper, Pres.
THE DIAL CORPORATION
A subsidiary of Henkel Corporation
19001 N SCOTTSDALE RD
SCOTTSDALE, AZ 85255

Brand Name:

Renuzit Super Odor Neutralizer

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

7. President
Fresh Products, LLC
4010 South Avenue
Toledo, OH 43615

#### **Brand Name:**

Fusion Air Fresheners, Microfusion Metered Aerosols, Fusion Air Fresheners, Linen fresh, MacIntosh apple, Cinnamon stick, Cotton blossom, Citrus sorbet, Vanilla bean, Bouquet, Cherry, Citrus, Mango, Springtime, Vanilla

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

8. Bart Becht, CEO RECKITT BENCKISER (USA) INC. 399 INTERPACE PKWY PARSIPPANY, NJ 07054-0225

#### **Brand Name:**

Disinfectant Spray, Disinfectant Spray To-Go, Neutra Air©, Feshmatic©, Neutra Air© Sanitizing Spray, LYSOL® NEUTRA AIR® Sanitizing Spray Aerosols, Crisp Breeze®, Fresh Waters®, Harvest Spice®, Lavender & Chamomile, Plumeria & Wild Rose, Sparkling Citrus®, Neutra Air®, Mountain Breeze, Morning Rain®, Tropical Escape™, Wildflower Mist, Mountain Breeze, Morning Rain and Tropical Escape, AIR WICK® Aerosol Sprays

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

H. Fisk Johnson, CEO
 S.C. Johnson & Son, Inc.
 1525 Howe Street
 Racine, Wisconsin 53403

#### Brand Name:

Floral, Fresh Breeze, Outdoor, Relaxing Moments, Spicy, Tropical, Vanilla, Angel Whispers, Apple Cinnamon, Berry Burst, Berry Splash, Clean Linen, Clean Linen & Sunny Days, Clear Springs, Country Garden, Creamy Custard & Blushing Apple, Dewberry Dreams, French Vanilla, Fresh Berries & Wild Raspberry, Fresh Mountain Morning, Fresh Scent. Fruit Explosion, Hawaiian Breeze, Hawaiian Breeze& Vanilla Passion Fruit, Jasmine and White Rose, Lavender & Vanilla, Lavender Meadow, Lemon & Chamomile, Mango Fusion, Melon Burst, Moonlit Walk & Wandering Stream, Neutralizer, Ocean Blue, Ocean Blue & Refreshing Surf, Orchid Oasis, Outdoor Fresh, Peaches & Petals, Pet Odor Eliminator, Powder Fresh, Pure Innocence, Rainshower, Refreshing Spa, Spiced Rose & Vanilla, Strawberries & Cream, Suddenly Spring, Sweet

Pea & Lilac, Tropical Mist, Tropical Moment, Vanilla Breeze, White Tea & Lily

Oust Surface Disinfectant & Air Sanitizer offered in 3 products: Clean Scent, Citrus Scent and Outdoor Scent

Oust Air Sanitizer offered in 5 products: Clean Scent, Citrus Scent, Outdoor Scent, Meadow<sup>TM</sup> Scent and Fragrance Free

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

10. Robert Macdonald, President
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY
ONE PROCTER & GAMBLE PLAZA
CINCINNATI, OH 45202

#### Brand Name:

Febreze Sport, Febreze Workout Odor Eliminator, Febreze Extreme Odor Eliminator, Febreze Laundry Odor Eliminating Boost, Febreze Hawaiian Aloha, Febreze Brazilian Carnaval, Febreze Moroccan Bazar, Febreze Winds & Sprintime

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

Carl Contadini, CEO
 Waterbury Companies, Inc.
 P.O. Box 640
 Independence, LA 70443

#### Brand Name:

Time Mist "Metered Air Freshener", TIME MIST 9000 SHOT METERED AIR FRESHENER, Micro Time Mist with Odor Counteractant, Ozium, Model 1000 Meter Dispen-Beige, Ozium Metered Air Sanitizer, Country Vet Air Freshner, Mango, Country Vet Insect Odor Control, Eucalyptus Mist Spray for Horses, Country Vet Aerosol, Micro Metered Spray Fly Refill, Highly Active Farm & Home Spray, Country Vet Mosquito & Fly Spray, Country Vet Farm & Home Bomb, Country Vet Air Freshener, Country Vet Air Freshener, Cinnamon Spice, Vanilla Caramel, Country Vet Air Freshener Refill, Cucumber Melon, Country Vet Metered Mosquito & Fly Spray, Country Vet Metered Air Freshener Refill, Country Vet Flying Insect Spray

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

George W. Buckley, President and CEO
 3M COMPANY
 3M CENTER BLDG 224-5N-40
 ST PALU, MN 55144

**Brand Names:** 

Air Freshener Ocean Mist, AIR FRESHENER - FRESH SCENT, DOSE 'n FILL CLEANING SYSTEM, DEODORIZER - FRESH SCENT - CONCENTRATE Twist 'n Fill(TM) System, DEODORIZER- FRESH SCENT CONCENTRATE, Fiber Fresh Cleaner, Scotch-Brite (TM) DOSE 'n FILL CLEANING SYSTEM, (PDF, 29KB) 3M(TM) DEODORIZER - FRESH SCENT - Ready-to-Use.

### CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Anthony G. Graham, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the Violator has violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposures to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- 3. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 4. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed at Costa Mesa, California on July 14, 2009.

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 950 South Coast Drive, Suite 220, Costa Mesa, California 92626.

#### I SERVED THE FOLLOWING:

- 1.) Sixty Day Notice of Intent to Sue;
- 2.) Certificate of Merit
- 3.) Supporting Documents (sent only to AG)

by sending via US Mail to the person whose name and address and facsimile number is shown below:

Date of Mailing: July 23, 2009

Place of Mailing: Costa Mesa, California

NAME AND ADDRESS OF EACH PERSON TO WHOM DOCUMENTS WERE MAILED:

California Attorney General
Office of Proposition 65 Enforcement
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor, P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612\_0550

All entities listed on Attachments to Proof of Service,

I declare under penalty of perjury	under the laws of the State of California that the
foregoing is true and correct.	^

Dated: July 23, 2009

## ATTACHMENT 1 TO PROOF OF SERVICE NAMES AND ADDRESSES OF VIOLATORS:

- President
   Air Delights, Inc.
   9974 SW Arctic Dr.
   Beaverton, OR. 97005
- President
   Chase Products Co.
   19th and Gardner Road
   Broadview, IL 60155
- 3. President
  Claire Manufacturing Company
  1005 Westgate
  Addison, IL 60101

Ofer Sababosh, President The Betty Mills Company 2121 S. El Camino Real Suite D-100 San Mateo, CA 94403

- Christopher B. (Chris) Combe, President Combe Incorporated
   1101 Westchester Avenue
   White Plains, N.Y. 10654
- President
   CONTINENTAL MFG CO
   123 Byasee
   Hazelwood, MO 63042
- 6. Bradley A. Casper, Pres.
  THE DIAL CORPORATION
  A subsidiary of Henkel Corporation
  19001 N SCOTTSDALE RD
  SCOTTSDALE, AZ 85255

# 7. President Fresh Products, LLC 4010 South Avenue Toledo, OH 43615

#### 8. Bart Becht, CEO RECKITT BENCKISER (USA) INC. 399 INTERPACE PKWY PARSIPPANY, NJ 07054-0225

## 9. H. Fisk Johnson, CEOS.C. Johnson & Son, Inc.1525 Howe StreetRacine, Wisconsin 53403

## 10. Robert Macdonald, President THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY ONE PROCTER & GAMBLE PLAZA CINCINNATI, OH 45202

- Carl Contadini, CEOWaterbury Companies, Inc.P.O. Box 640Independence, LA 70443
- George W. Buckley, President and CEO
  3M COMPANY
  3M CENTER BLDG 224-5N-40
  ST PALU, MN 55144

### ATTACHMENT 2 TO PROOF OF SERVICE LIST OF DISTRICT ATTORNEYS SERVED:

San Diego City Attorney 1200 3rd Ave. Ste. 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

Los Angeles City Attorney 200 N. Main St. N.E. Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Francisco City Attorney

1390 Market Street

San Francisco, CA 94102

Riverside County DA 4075 Main St., 1<sup>st</sup> Fl. Riverside, CA 92501

Sacramento County DA P.O. Box 749 Sacramento, CA 95812

San Jose City Attorney 151 W. Mission St. San Jose, CA 95110

Humboldt County DA 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

San Mateo District Attorney 1050 Mission Road South San Francisco, CA 94080

Sonoma County DA 600 Administrative Dr. Santa Rosa, CA 95403

Yolo County D A 301 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Woodland, CA 95695 San Diego County District Attorney 330 Broadway San Diego, CA 92101

Los Angeles County DA 210 W. Temple Street, 18th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Francisco County DA 880 Bryant Street

San Francisco, CA 94103

San Bernardino County DA 316 N. Mountain View Av. San Bernardino, CA 92415

Orange County District Attorney 700 Civic Center Dr. W., 2<sup>nd</sup> Fl. Santa Ana, CA 92701

Santa Clara County DA 2645 Zanker Road San Jose, CA 95134

Shasta County District Attorney 1525 Court Street Redding, CA 96001-1632

Marin County DA 3501 Civic Center Dr. #130 San Rafael, CA 94903

Contra Costa County DA 727 Court Street Martinez, CA 94553

District Attorney 1430 Freedom Blvd. Watsonville, CA 95076 El Dorado County DA 1360 Johnson Blvd. #105 South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150

Napa County DA 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559

Inyo County DA 386 W. Line Street Bishop, CA 93514

Lake County DA 255 N. Forbes St. Lakeport, CA 95453

Stanislaus County DA 300 Starr Avenue Turlock, CA 95380

District Attorney 14227 Road 28 Madera, CA 93638

Sutter County DA 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991

Mariposa County DA P.O. Box 748 Mariposa, CA 95338

Nevada County DA 201 Church Street, Suite 8 Nevada City, CA 95959

San Luis Obispo County DA 1050 Monterey Street, Rm. 450 San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

Merced County DA 445 I Street Los Banos CA 93635 Ventura County DA 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 95695

Kern County DA 2100 College Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93305

San Joaquin DA 225 W. Elm Street #C Lodi, CA 95240

Mendocino County DA 700 S. Franklin St. Fort Bragg, CA 94537

Butte County DA 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95695

Orange County District Attorney 700 Civic Center Dr. W., 2<sup>nd</sup> Fl. Santa Ana, CA 92701

Solano County DA 321 Tuolomne Street Valejo, CA 94590

Santa Cruz County DA 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95061

Alameda County DA 1225 Fallon Street Oakland, CA 94612

Del Norte County DA 450 H Street Crescent City, CA 95531

Mondoc County DA

204 S Court Street Alturas CA 96101

Siskyou County DA P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

Santa Clara DA 2645 Zanker Rd San Jose CA 95134

Tulare County DA 425 E. KernTulare, CA 93274

Solano County DA 321 Tuolumne St

Inyo County DA PO Drawer D

Vallejo CA 94590

Independence, CA 93526

Glenn County DA 540 W Sycamore St Willows CA 95988

Mono County DA P.O. Box 617

Kings County DA 1400 W Lacey Blvd Bridgeport, CA 93517

Hanford CA 93230

Santa Barbara County DA 1105 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101

Riverside DA 82675 US Hwy 111 FL4 Indio CA 92201

Santa Rosa D.A. 111 N Pythian Rd Santa Rosa CA 95409

Monterey County DA 240 Church St. Salinas, CA 93902

Placer County DA 11562 B Avenue Auburn, CA 95603

Fresno County DA 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: July 14, 2009